

CIVILLE & TANG

2nd Floor, Cabrera Center
PMB 86, P.O. Box 10003
Saipan, MP 96950-8908
Telephone: 670/235-1725
Facsimile: 670/235-1726

FILED
Clerk
District Court

DEC 29 2005

Attorneys for Defendants

*Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands,
and Pamela Brown, personally and in her
official capacity as the Attorney General for the
Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands*

For The Northern Mariana Islands
By _____
(Deputy Clerk)

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN MARIANA ISLANDS**

ROSARIO DLG KUMAGAI,

Plaintiff,

vs.

PAMELA BROWN, a.k.a. PAMELA BROWN
BLACKBURN, personally and in her official
capacity as the Attorney General for the
Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands;
FERMIN M. ATALIG, personally and in his
official capacity as the Secretary of Finance;
COMMONWEALTH OF THE NORTHERN
MARIANA ISLANDS; MARIA LOURDES
SEMAN ADA, personally and in her official
capacity as the Executive Director for the
Commonwealth Development Authority;
COMMONWEALTH DEVELOPMENT
AUTHORITY; BANK OF GUAM; and JOHN
DOES ONE thru TEN,

Defendants.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 05-0037

**MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND
AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF
COMMONWEALTH OF THE
NORTHERN MARIANA ISLANDS AND
PAMELA BROWN'S MOTION
TO DISMISS**

Hearing Date: March 9, 2006
Hearing Time: 9 a.m.
Judge: Hon. Alex R. Munson

ORIGINAL

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. FACTS ALLEGED IN THE COMPLAINT	1
III. ARGUMENT	4
A. STANDARDS FOR A 12(b)(6) MOTION	4
B. FEDERAL CLAIMS	4
1. 42 U.S.C. § 1983	4
a) Claim barred against CNMI officers in their official capacity	4
b) Failure to allege a constitutional violation	4
i) No Due Process Violation	5
ii) Taking claim not actionable	6
iii) No equal protection violation	7
c) Section 1983 claim barred by qualified immunity	9
d) Section 1983 claim barred by absolute immunity	10
2. 42 U.S.C. § 1985(3)	11
C. STATE CLAIMS	12
1. Sovereign Immunity - CNMI and Defendant Brown in her Official Capacity	12
2. Absolute Immunity - Defendant Brown in her Personal Capacity	14
3. Common Law Conspiracy	16
4. Abuse of Process	16
5. Malicious Prosecution	17
6. Breach of Duty of Good Faith and Fair Dealing	19
7. Intentional Interference with Contractual Rights and Intentional Interference with Economic Relations	20
8. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress and Negligent Infliction of Emotional Distress	21
IV. CONCLUSION	25

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	<u>Page</u>
<u>Cases</u>	
<i>Ahmed v. Goldberg</i> , Nos. Civ. A. 00-0005, Civ. A. 99-0046, 2001 WL 1842399, *9 (D.N. Mar. I. May 11, 2001)	13, 23
<i>Art Metal-U.S.A., Inc. v. United States</i> , 753 F.2d 1151 (D. C. Cir. 1985)	14
<i>Associated General Contractors of California, Inc. v. California State Council of Carpenters</i> , 459 U.S. 519 (1983)	4
<i>Bass v. First Pacific Networks, Inc.</i> , 219 F.3d 1052 n.2 (9th Cir. 2000)	13
<i>Bly-Magee v. California</i> , 236 F.3d 1014 (9th Cir. 2001)	10, 21
<i>Bray v. Alexandria Women's Health Clinic</i> , 506 U.S. 263 (1993)	11
<i>Charfauros v. Board of Elections</i> , 1998 MP 16, 5 N.M.I. 188, 1998 WL 34073646, *16-17 (N.M.I. 1998)	23
<i>Coors Brewing Co. v. Floyd</i> , 978 P.2d 663 (Colo. 1999)	24
<i>De Nieva v. Reyes</i> , 966 F.2d 480 (9th Cir.1992)	4
<i>Dillon v. City of New York</i> , 261 A.D.2d 34, 704 N.Y.S.2d 1 (N.Y.A.D. 1999)	23
<i>Eaton v. Continental General Ins. Co.</i> , 147 F. Supp. 2d 829 (N.D. Ohio 2001)	24
<i>Ecclesiastical Order of the Ism of Am, Inc. v. Chasin</i> , 845 F.2d 113 (6th Cir. 1988)	13
<i>Empress LLC v. City & County of San Francisco</i> , 419 F.3d 1052 (9th Cir. 2005)	4
<i>Fairchild v. Park</i> , 109 Cal.Rptr.2d 442 (Cal. Ct. App. 2001)	19
<i>Fry v. Melaragno</i> , 939 F.2d 832 (9th Cir. 1991)	10, 15, 21
<i>Gannett Fleming West, Inc. v. Village of Angel Fire</i> , 375 F. Supp. 2d 1104 (D.N.M. 2004)	5-7
<i>Gay v. Garvey</i> , No. Civ.A. 03-CV-01485, 2004 WL 2203730, *1 (E.D. Pa. Sept. 30, 2004)	22

	<u>Page</u>
1	
2	<i>Griffin v. Breckenridge</i> , 403 U.S. 88 (U.S. 1971) 11
3	<i>Hardy v. Vision Service Plan</i> , 120 P.3d 402 (Mont. 2005) 19
4	<i>Hiraga v. House</i> ,
5	C.N.M.I. Super. Ct. Civ. No. 98-0100A, p. 6 (July 29, 1999) 16
6	<i>Hutchinson v. United States</i> , 677 F.2d 1322 (9th Cir. 1982) 13
7	<i>I.G.I. Gen. Contractor & Dev., Inc. V. Public School Sys.</i> ,
8	1999 MP 12 ¶ 12, 5 N.M.I. 250 (N.M.I. 1999) 16
9	<i>Jaco v. Bloechle</i> , 739 F.2d 239 (6th Cir.1984) 11
10	<i>Jama Const. v. City of Los Angeles</i> ,
11	938 F.2d 1045 (9th Cir. 1991) 6
12	<i>JHE, Inc. v. Southeastern Pennsylvania Transp. Auth.</i> , No. 1790 Nov. Term 2001,
13	2002 WL 1018941, *7 (Pa.Com.Pl. May 17, 2002) 19
14	<i>Johnson v. Knowles</i> , 113 F.3d 1114 (9th Cir. 1997) 5
15	<i>Kwai Fun Wong v. United States</i> , 373 F.3d 952 (9th Cir. 2004) 9
16	<i>Lucas v. New York City</i> , 842 F. Supp. 101 (S.D.N.Y. 1994) 12
17	<i>Lucky Development Co., Ltd. v. Tokai, U.S.A., Inc.</i> ,
18	3 N.M.I. 379, pp. 94-95 (N.M.I. 1992) 20
19	<i>Mangold v. California Pub. Utils. Comm'n</i> ,
20	67 F.3d 1470 (9th Cir.1995) 13
21	<i>Mitchell v. Estate of Hillblom</i> ,
22	1997 MP 30 ¶ 2, 5 N.M.I. 136 (N.M.I. 1997) 17
23	<i>Muniz v. Kravis</i> , 757 A.2d 1207 (Conn. App. 2000) 23-24
24	<i>Nelson v. City of Selma</i> , 881 F.2d 836 (9th Cir. 1989) 7
25	<i>North American Energy Systems, LLC v. New England Energy</i>
26	<i>Management, Inc.</i> , 269 F. Supp. 2d 12 (D.Conn. 2002) 21
27	<i>Numrich v. U.S. Postal Service</i> , No. CV-01-532-ST,
28	2002 WL 31440877, *3 (D. Or. Jan. 3, 2002) 22
	<i>Parrish v. Consolidated City of Jacksonville</i> , No. 304CV986J32HTS,
	2005 WL 1500894 (M.D. Fla. June 22, 2005) 8
	<i>Pepperell Trust Co. v. Mountain Heir Financial Corp.</i> ,
	708 A.2d 651, 656 (Me. 1998) 18

	<u>Page</u>
<i>Peters v. Fair</i> , 427 F.3d 1035 (6th Cir. 2005)	11
<i>Piorkowski v. Parziale</i> , No. 3:02CV00963, 2003 WL 21037353, *3 (D. Conn. May 7, 2003)	12
<i>Scheuer v. Rhodes</i> , 416 U.S. 232, 94 S.Ct. 1683, 40 L.Ed.2d 90 (1974)	4
<i>Smith v. Hurd</i> , 699 F. Supp. 1433 (D. Hawaii 1988)	19
<i>Spear v. Town of West Hartford</i> , 954 F.2d 63 (2nd Cir. 1992)	10, 15, 21
<i>Swedish Civil Aviation Admin. v. Project Management Enterprises, Inc.</i> , 190 F.Supp.2d 785 (D.Md. 2002)	19
<i>Thornton v. City of St. Helens</i> , 425 F.3d 1158 (9th Cir. 2005)	7
<i>Tucson Airport Auth. v. Gen. Dynamics Corp.</i> , 136 F.3d 641 (9th Cir.1998)	20
<i>United Broth. of Carpenters and Joiners of America</i> , <i>Local 610, AFL-CIO v. Scott</i> , 463 U.S. 825 (1983)	12
<i>Usher v. City of Los Angeles</i> , 828 F.2d 556 (9th Cir. 1987)	6
<i>West v. Atkins</i> , 487 U.S. 42, 108 S.Ct. 2250 (1988)	5
<i>Williams v. Alabama State University</i> , 102 F.3d 1179 (11th Cir. 1997)	9
<i>Worldlogics Corp. v. Chatham Reinsurance Corp.</i> , 108 P.3d 5 (Okla.Civ.App. 2004)	19
<i>Zavatsky v. Anderson</i> , 130 F. Supp. 2d 349 (D. Conn. 2001)	8
 <u>Statutes</u>	
28 U.S.C.	
§ 2680	13
§ 2680(h)	14, 22
42 U.S.C.	
§ 1983	3-7, 9-10, 15
§ 1985(3)	3, 11
7 CMC	
§ 2202	13
§ 2204	13
§ 2204(a)	13
§ 2204(b)	13-14, 16-17, 20, 22-23

1		<u>Page</u>
2	7 CMC	
3	§ 2251	19, 20
4	§ 2251(b)	6, 20
5	§ 2503(d)	6
6	§ 3401	12

Rules

Federal Rules of Civil Procedure

Rule 8(a)	4
Rule 12(b)(6)	<i>passim</i>

Secondary Authorities

RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS

§ 46, cmt. d (1965)	24
§ 674 (1977)	18
§ 682 (1977)	16-17
§ 682 cmt. b (1977)	17
§ 895D (1979)	14, 21
§ 895D cmt. c (1979)	14
§ 895D cmt. i (1979)	15